



From: Broadcasting Board of Governors
Date: December 18, 2014
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of December 18, 2014**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today in the Cohen Building (BBG headquarters) in Washington, D.C. The meeting was open for public attendance as seating capacity allowed and for public observation via streaming on the BBG website.

The meeting was attended by the following Board members:

Chairman Jeffrey Shell
Governor Matthew Armstrong
Governor Ryan Crocker
Governor Michael Kempner
Governor Kenneth Weinstein
Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy and Public Affairs Richard Stengel

Governor Michael Meehan was not in attendance.

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1.

The Chairman called the meeting to order and noted that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act and streamed live over the Internet at the BBG website.

Chairman Shell acknowledged and welcomed new Board members Michael Kempner and Dr. Leon Aron, who was absent due to a prior commitment and was unable to be formally sworn-in office. He recognized attendance by Ms. Karen Kornbluh and noted that she had not yet been confirmed as a member of the Board. He briefly introduced Governors Kempner and Aron, and nominee Ms. Kornbluh.

The Chairman then offered a tribute to Governor Meehan for his four years of service on the Board and noted that the Board plans to formally thank Governor Meehan. At the Chairman's invitation, there followed comments from other Governors, expressing their gratitude for Governor Meehan's work and contributions.

Chairman Shell announced the presence of Andy Lack, designated Chief Executive Officer and Director of Broadcasting Board of Governors and noted that his appointment was almost finalized.

Minutes of December 18, 2014 Meeting

Before moving to Board business, Chairman Shell brought attention to the threats that BBG journalists have faced since the last Board meeting. He noted that the BBG networks operate in media environments where authoritarian countries, struggling to control both information and their citizens, seek to censor objective voices and crack down on civil society, including independent press. He highlighted the following incidents: (1) Khadija Ismayilova, an investigative journalist for Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty's (RFE/RL) Azerbaijani Service, was sent to pre-trial in Azerbaijan being unjustly punished for her reporting on government corruption and human rights abuses of the country, and on behalf of the Board, the Chairman called on Azeri authorities for her immediate release; (2) Omar Al Obaidi, a reporter for Alhurra-Iraq, and his cameraman were attacked, shot at, and escaped with minor injuries; (3) the brothers of Shohret Hoshur, a reporter for Radio Free Asia's Uyghur Service, were detained by Chinese authorities in an attempt to silence Mr. Hoshur's reporting on the unrest in China's Xinjiang Uyghur autonomous region; and (4) Bashar Fahmi, a correspondent of Alhurra, has not been seen or heard from since his disappearance over two years ago during a reporting trip in Aleppo, Syria. The Chairman stated that the Board takes seriously the safety of BBG's journalists and hopes the attention both here in Washington and among international advocates can help improve the dire situations of the journalists and their families, and rectify these gross violations of human rights.

The Chairman welcomed Oleksandr Motsyk, Ambassador of Ukraine to the United States, and invited David Ensor, Director of Voice of America (VOA), to introduce the Ambassador. Upon Mr. Ensor's introduction, Ambassador Motsyk presented the Princess Olga Medal (an award given in Ukraine bestowed on women of outstanding personal merit) on behalf of the President of the Ukraine to Myroslava Gongadze, anchor of VOA Ukrainian Service's flagship TV program *Chas-Time*. On behalf of the Board, the Chairman thanked the Ambassador and congratulated Ms. Gongadze.

Chairman Shell then paused to pay tribute to Mark Helmke, who passed away on November 1, 2014. At the Chairman's invitation, Governor Armstrong gave remarks, touching on Mr. Helmke's work and his importance to the BBG.

Chairman Shell asked Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting, to discuss recent developments concerning normalization of U.S.-Cuba relations. Mr. Garcia-Perez described the reactions from the island. He noted that Cuba is still violating human rights and emphasized the critical role of the Martis.

Moving to Board business, the Chairman stated that the presence of five or more Governors satisfies the Board's quorum requirement, permitting the Board to conduct business based on majority vote, a quorum being present. He said that the Board members had received by email materials for the consent agenda, and that he had not received comments from any Governors.

Chairman Shell described the three items on the consent agenda for the Board's consideration: (1) Minutes of October 30, 2014 meeting; (2) Resolution honoring VOA's Ukrainian Service 65th anniversary; and (3) Resolution Honoring RFE/RL's Radio Marshall 5th Anniversary. There being no comments, Under Secretary Stengel made a motion to adopt the consent agenda.

Minutes of December 18, 2014 Meeting

Governor Armstrong seconded. The Board passed the consent agenda unanimously with an abstention by Governor Kempner.

In accordance with the Board's prior protocol for allowing members of the public to speak at meetings, the Chairman invited Ann Noonan, Co-founder and Executive Director of Committee for U.S. International Broadcasting; Carolyn Presutti, TV correspondent for VOA Central News; and Alan Heil, Public Diplomacy Council, to address the Board for three minutes each.

The Board took a short recess and reconvened for an overview of the International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) led by the Interim Management Team: André Mendes, Director of Global Operations; Robert Bole, Director of Global Strategy; and Suzie Carroll, Director of Global Communications. At the conclusion of the IBB "Deep Dive," the Chairman noted that this completes the first round of "Deep Dives," and that VOA will start the next round in 2015.

Chairman Shell announced the Board's participation in a presentation of the David Burke Distinguished Journalism Awards which immediately follows the Board meeting. He stated that the next Board meeting will take place at BBG Headquarters in Washington, D.C., on February 18, 2015. The Chairman then adjourned the meeting.

The Broadcasting Board of Governors agreed to the following decision elements (all decisions were adopted by a unanimous vote unless otherwise indicated):

1. Adoption of Minutes of October 30, 2014. The Board adopted the minutes of the October 30, 2014 meeting of the plenary Board as set forth in Attachment 2.
2. Resolution Honoring Voice of America's (VOA) Ukrainian Service 65th Anniversary. The Board adopted the resolution honoring VOA's Ukrainian Service 65th Anniversary as set forth in Attachment 3.
3. Resolution Honoring Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty's (RFE/RL) Radio Mashaal 5th Anniversary. The Board adopted the resolution honoring RFE/RL's Radio Mashaal 5th Anniversary as set forth in Attachment 4.

Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: IBB Director of Global Communications and BBG Executive Director Suzie Carroll; IBB Director of Global Operations and Acting Chief Financial Officer (CFO) Andre Mendes; IBB Director of Global Strategy Robert Bole; General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey; Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran; Director of Public Affairs Letitia King; Public Affairs Specialist Anastasia Kolobrodova; Writer-Editor (Multimedia) Laurie Moy; Director of Graphics Jennifer Lea Ramsey; Director of Research and Assessments Sonja Gloeckle; Mobile Products Manager William Sullivan; Media Strategist Paul Marszalek; Acting Director of the Office of Performance Review Jeffrey Trimble; IBB Chief of Staff Marie Lennon; Director of the Office of Civil Rights Delia Johnson; Director of the Office of Contracts Cherylynn Peters; Director of the Office of Workforce Support and Development David Milligan; Director of Strategy and

Minutes of December 18, 2014 Meeting

Development Bruce Sherman; Acting Director of the Office of Security Frederick Lang; Deputy Engineering Resource and Acting Deputy CFO Connie Stephens; Deputy Engineering Services and Acting Director of the Office of Technology, Services and Innovation Terry Balazs; Regional Marketing Officer Oscar Barcelo; Special Advisor to the Director of Global Operations and Acting CFO Victor Morales; Deputy for Technology Support Services Veris Burton; President Management Fellow - Management and Policy Analyst Nicholas Fechter; David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America; Kelu Chao, VOA Associate Director for Language Programming and Acting Chief of Staff; Scott Stearns, VOA Correspondent at State Department; Myroslava Gongadze, VOA Ukrainian Service; Rebecca McMenamen, VOA Senior Advisor of Strategy; Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting; John Giambalvo, Interim Manager for RFE/RL; Nenad Pejic, RFE/RL Interim Manager (via telephone); Christine Fetzko, RFE/RL Director of Corporate Strategy & Operations; Ben Herman, RFE/RL General Counsel; Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia (RFA); Bernadette Burns, RFA General Counsel; Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks; Dan Sreebny, Senior Advisor for BBG, Office of the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs; and BBG nominee Karen Kornbluh.

Approved:

Jeffrey Shell
Chairman

Witnessed:

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey
Board Secretary

Attachments:

1. Agenda for December 18, 2014 Meeting
2. Minutes of the October 30, 2014 Board Meeting
3. Resolution Honoring VOA's Ukrainian Service 65th Anniversary
4. Resolution Honoring RFE/RL's Radio Mashaal 5th Anniversary

Minutes of December 18, 2014 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 1

BROADCASTING BOARD OF GOVERNORS

December 2014 Meeting Agenda

(ALL MEETINGS ARE AT THE COHEN BUILDING, UNLESS OTHERWISE NOTED.)

Thursday, December 18

9:00 - 11:30 Broadcasting Board of Governors' Open Meeting (BBG-IBB Conference Room)

Chairman's Remarks

A. Consent Agenda

- Minutes of October 30, 2014 Meeting
- Resolution Honoring Voice of America's Ukrainian Service 65th Anniversary
- Resolution Honoring Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty's Radio Mashaal 5th Anniversary

B. Public Comments

9:30 Break

9:45 - 11:30 BBG Open Meeting Continued

C. International Broadcasting Bureau Overview

D. Other Items for Consideration at Next Board Meeting

Minutes of December 18, 2014 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 2

From: Broadcasting Board of Governors
Date: October 30, 2014
Subject: **Minutes of the BBG Meeting of October 30, 2014**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) met today in the auditorium of the Cohen Building (BBG headquarters) in Washington, D.C. The meeting was open for public attendance as seating capacity allowed and for public observation via streaming on the BBG website.

The meeting was attended by the following Board members:

Chairman Jeffrey Shell
Governor Matthew Armstrong (via telephone)
Governor Ryan Crocker (via telephone)
Governor Michael Meehan
Governor Kenneth Weinstein
Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy and Public Affairs Richard Stengel

Other persons in attendance are listed at the end of these minutes.

The agenda of the meeting is set forth in Attachment 1.

The Chairman called the meeting to order and noted that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Government in the Sunshine Act and streamed live over the Internet at the BBG website.

Chairman Shell noted that, in September, the Board had announced its intent to name Andy Lack as Chief Executive Officer of U.S. international media. The Chairman said that, while the details of Mr. Lack's appointment were still being finalized, the Board anticipates his attendance at the December 2014 Board meeting.

Before moving to Board business, the Chairman reported on the threats BBG journalists have faced since the last Board meeting. He noted that the BBG networks operate in media environments where authoritarian countries, struggling to control both information and their citizens, seek to censor objective voices and crack down on civil society, including independent press. He highlighted the following incidents: (1) In Azerbaijan, Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL) correspondent Khadija Ismayilova, according to her, was recently detained and charged with libel because of her reporting on corruption within the Azeri government and has been blocked from travelling outside the country; (2) In Crimea, RFE/RL journalists have repeatedly been harassed for their reporting on sensitive issues; (3) In Cuba, Radio/TV Marti contributors have been detained, and activists have been threatened for speaking with Office of

Minutes of December 18, 2014 Meeting

Cuba Broadcasting (OCB) reporters; (4) In China, police tried to intimidate Voice of America (VOA) correspondent Fred Wang with two hours of questioning, following his news report about Uyghurs; and (5) In the Middle East, journalists are being jailed under fabricated charges, ISIL is executing journalists, and Alhurra's Bashar Fahmi, who disappeared while reporting in Aleppo, Syria, has been missing for over two years.

The Chairman announced the recent launch of a new program that delivers news and information to Russian-language audiences to combat Russian media attempts to spread propaganda and misinformation. He also acknowledged that the BBG has been the only news source for people on mainland China to rely upon during the ongoing protests in Hong Kong. Lastly, he recognized VOA correspondents' efforts to report on the continuing Ebola crisis in Guinea and Liberia, and reiterated the Board's standing belief in the power of a free press. On behalf of the Board, the Chairman thanked all BBG journalists for their commitment and dedicated efforts, despite the threats they continue to face throughout the course of their work.

Chairman Shell paid tribute to legendary journalist and former executive editor of The Washington Post, Ben Bradlee, who passed away on October 21, 2014.

Moving to Board business, the Chairman stated that the presence of five or more Governors satisfies the Board's quorum requirement, permitting the Board to conduct business based on majority vote, a quorum being present. He said that the Board had received by email materials for the consent agenda, and that he did not receive comments from any Governors.

Chairman Shell described the two items on the consent agenda for the Board's consideration: (1) Draft minutes of the August 13, 2014 Board meeting; and (2) Resolution proposing BBG meeting dates in 2015. He noted that one of the meetings will be held at the RFE/RL headquarters in Prague, so the date of that meeting may be amended. Governor Meehan clarified that BBG Committees will continue to meet in alternating months, though those dates have not been determined. There being no further comments, Chairman Shell made a motion to adopt the consent agenda. Governor Meehan seconded. The Board voted unanimously to adopt the consent agenda.

The Chairman shifted the discussion to the creation of a Special Committee on the Future of VOA. He noted that, in September, the Advisory Committee had considered two topics for a future special committee. The Advisory Committee then agreed to establish a Special Committee on the Future of VOA to undertake a comprehensive review of VOA as an element of U.S. international media. A draft resolution to establish such a special committee had been provided to the Board for its consideration, but upon receipt of several comments by VOA Director David Ensor, an amended resolution was then circulated again to the Board on October 29, 2014. At Chairman Shell's invitation, Governor Meehan expressed that he appreciates both versions of the resolution and hopes that the special committee will specifically consider the role of VOA, a "legacy organization," in the digital age. Chairman Shell noted that there is a clause in the resolution that states the special committee will assess VOA in the context of the other BBG networks and consider the regions or countries in which multiple BBG networks have a presence, in an attempt to determine the best approach or strategy in that region. Governor

Minutes of December 18, 2014 Meeting

Armstrong commented that this special committee should focus on how to strengthen the VOA brand. Following comments from the Governors, Chairman Shell volunteered to be a member and proposed that Governor Armstrong would serve as Committee Chair. The Board voted to adopt the amended resolution to establish a Special Committee on Voice of America in the 21st Century with five (5) votes, while Governor Crocker abstained because he did not receive the amended resolution. Governors Meehan and Weinstein also volunteered to serve on the special committee.

Before allowing time for public comments, Chairman Shell acknowledged the departure of Director of Communications and External Affairs Lynne Weil. The Chairman, as well as Governors Armstrong and Meehan, thanked Ms. Weil for her service and wished her well in her next endeavor.

In accordance with the Board's prior protocol for allowing members of the public to speak at meetings, the Chairman invited Ann Noonan, Co-founder and Executive Director of Committee for U.S. International Broadcasting; Alan Heil, Public Diplomacy Council; Jingsheng Wei, Chairman of the Overseas Chinese Democracy Coalition; and Gregory Burns, AFSCME Local 1418 Union to address the Board for three minutes each.

Following public comment, Governor Meehan requested that the Special Committee on VOA in the 21st Century allow members of the public to participate in the committee's review process. He also suggested a response to Ann Noonan on the case of the 2009 reduction in force at OCB. Chairman Shell reaffirmed the Board's commitment to implement the arbitrator's award but acknowledged that the information is attorney-client privileged.

The Board took a short recess and reconvened for a panel discussion titled, "What's the Secret to Media Brand Loyalty? Storytelling in the Digital Age."

At the conclusion of the panel discussion, the Chairman thanked the panelists for their participation and noted that the next meeting of the plenary Board will be held on December 18, 2014. Chairman Shell then adjourned the meeting.

The Broadcasting Board of Governors agreed to the following decision elements (all decisions were adopted by a unanimous vote unless otherwise indicated):

1. Adoption of Minutes of August 13, 2014. The Board adopted the minutes of the August 13, 2014 meeting of the plenary Board as set forth in Attachment 2.
2. Resolution Proposing BBG Meeting Dates in 2015. The Board adopted the resolution proposing BBG meeting dates in 2015 as set forth in Attachment 3.
3. Resolution Establishing a Special Committee on Voice of America in the 21st Century. Chairman Shell made a motion to adopt the amended resolution to establish a Special Committee on Voice of America in the 21st Century. Governor Weinstein seconded the motion. Governor Crocker abstained. The amended resolution was adopted by the Board as set forth in Attachment 4.

Minutes of December 18, 2014 Meeting

Other Attendees:

The following persons were also present during all or part of the meeting: IBB Director of Global Communications and BBG Executive Director Suzie Carroll; IBB Director of Global Operations Andre Mendes; IBB Director of Global Strategy Robert Bole; General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey; Director of Board Operations Oanh Tran; Director of Public Affairs Letitia King; Director of Communications and External Affairs Lynne Weil; Public Affairs Specialist Anastasia Kolobrodova; David Ensor, Director of the Voice of America; Carlos Garcia-Perez, Director of the Office of Cuba Broadcasting; John Giambalvo, Interim Manager for Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL); Nenad Pejic, RFE/RL Interim Manager; Libby Liu, President of Radio Free Asia; Brian Conniff, President of the Middle East Broadcasting Networks; and Dan Sreebny, Senior Advisor for BBG, Office of the Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy & Public Affairs.

Approved:

Jeffrey Shell
Chairman

Witnessed:

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey
Board Secretary

Attachments:

1. Agenda for October 30, 2014 Meeting
2. Minutes of the August 13, 2014 Board Meeting
3. Resolution Proposing BBG Meeting Dates in 2015
4. Resolution Establishing a Special Committee on Voice of America in the 21st Century

Minutes of December 18, 2014 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 3

RESOLUTION HONORING THE 65TH ANNIVERSARY OF VOICE OF AMERICA'S UKRAINIAN SERVICE

December 18, 2014

WHEREAS, the Voice of America (VOA) began broadcasting in Ukrainian on December 12, 1949, to provide accurate, balanced and comprehensive news and information to the Ukrainian people;

WHEREAS, the VOA's Ukrainian Service has served for decades as a vital communications link to the Ukrainian people in support of freedom and democracy during the dark days of Soviet communist rule and through the challenges Ukraine faces today;

WHEREAS, with the breakup of the Soviet Union in 1991, the VOA's Ukrainian Service continued its mission to a newly independent Ukraine;

WHEREAS, the VOA's Ukrainian Service has successfully adopted television, online and mobile platforms to reach even greater numbers of Ukrainians;

WHEREAS, the VOA Ukrainian Service is a leading source of information for Ukrainians about U.S. official commentary and expert analysis on Ukraine, including such historic milestones as the Orange Revolution and the *Euromaidan* Revolution, as well as Russia's current aggression against Ukraine.

WHEREAS, the VOA Ukrainian Service is a unique source of information for Ukrainians about American society and its achievements in democratic governance, business, medicine, science, technology and the arts, which can serve as an inspiration and a model for Ukraine;

WHEREAS, VOA Ukrainian has nurtured and developed successful partnerships with leading Ukrainian national television networks such as Channel 5, First National TV, ICTV, Channel 24 and 1+1 TV;

WHEREAS, on the occasion of the 60th anniversary of VOA's Ukrainian Service in 2009, Senator Ben Cardin and Representatives Marcy Kaptur, Sander Levin, Jim Gerlach and Robert Wexler entered statements in the Congressional Record commending the service;

WHEREAS, VOA Ukrainian remains a respected source of objective and accurate information about Ukraine, East European region, the United States and the rest of the world, with a major focus on democratic consolidation and the Ukrainian people's aspirations for integration with the West;

WHEREAS, VOA Ukrainian continues to broadcast to more than 45 million people in Ukraine; and

Minutes of December 18, 2014 Meeting

WHEREAS, VOA Ukrainian is the leading international broadcaster in Ukraine, surpassing its competitors with its audience reach on multiple platforms – television, Internet, social media and mobile – and with its TV programs airing on major national networks in Ukraine.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved by the Broadcasting Board of Governors that we celebrate and commemorate the 65th anniversary of the Voice of America’s Ukrainian Service.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Broadcasting Board of Governors commends and congratulates both the current and former members of the Voice of America’s Ukrainian Service for their dedication in serving the Ukrainian people and fostering friendship and the open communication of information and ideas between them and the United States.

Minutes of December 18, 2014 Meeting

ATTACHMENT 4

RESOLUTION HONORING THE 5TH ANNIVERSARY OF RADIO MASHAAL OF RADIO FREE EUROPE/RADIO LIBERTY

December 18, 2014

WHEREAS, Radio Mashaal was launched on January 15, 2010, is part of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty (RFE/RL), Inc. and will be celebrating its fifth anniversary in 2015;

WHEREAS, Radio Mashaal has served as an essential broadcast and online source of news, information and entertainment for the Pashto-speaking peoples of Pakistan and the border regions of Afghanistan and Pakistan;

WHEREAS, Radio Mashaal was created as a response to “Mullah Radios” set up by Islamic extremists to recruit young people for suicide squads and to spread anti-U.S. hatred;

WHEREAS, Radio Mashaal’s dedicated and talented staff of journalists in Pakistan’s long-neglected Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province risk their lives every day to provide its listeners and visitors up-to-the-minute news;

WHEREAS, Radio Mashaal has earned a reputation for professionalism and a focus on local issues, such as the impact of natural disasters in 2010, 2013 and 2014 and by providing award-winning coverage of the plight of Pashtun families displaced by the Pakistani Army’s ongoing anti-extremist military operation;

WHEREAS, Radio Mashaal expands the spectrum of ideas, opinions and perspectives available in the region and has facilitated the growth of democracy by organizing election debates in 2013 among candidates to represent the FATA in the Pakistani parliament;

WHEREAS, Radio Mashaal emphasizes in its programs the importance of access to modern health care and education for all, without regard to gender or economic situation; and

WHEREAS, Radio Mashaal is returning the Pashtun tradition of tolerance to this war-torn region, hosting cultural programs by popular entertainers forced to flee by Islamic extremists.

NOW, THEREFORE, be it resolved by the Broadcasting Board of Governors that we celebrate and commemorate the fifth anniversary of Radio Mashaal.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Board applauds and thanks current and former members of the Radio Mashaal team for their dedication to professional journalism.