



From: Broadcasting Board of Governors  
Date: September 15, 2011  
Subject: **Transcript of BBG Meeting at 9:45 A.M. on September 15, 2011**

The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) had previously voted to close this meeting to receive and consider staff recommendations regarding the Fiscal Year 2013 budget (please see attached Federal Register notice).

The meeting was attended by the following Board members:

Chairman Walter Isaacson  
Governor Victor Ashe  
Governor Michael Lynton (via telephone)  
Governor Susan McCue (via telephone)  
Governor Michael Meehan  
Governor Dennis Mulhaupt  
Governor Dana Perino  
Acting Under Secretary of State Ann Stock (via telephone)

Governor S. Enders Wimbush was not in attendance at the meeting.

Director of the International Broadcasting Bureau (IBB) Richard Lobo, Executive Director Jeffrey Trimble, Chief Financial Officer Maryjean Buhler, Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, and Special Projects Officer Oanh Tran were in attendance as well.

ISAACSON: [recording begins]...Items and things that are supposed to be confidential but also the Government in the Sunshine Act that say we're supposed to be open, and that we're going to avoid trying to reveal any depths of Office of Management and Budget (OMB) submission information or substance, but we're going to navigate this so we don't have to vote to close this meeting. Is that ok by the two of you?

LYNTON: Absolutely.

MCCUE: Yep.

ISAACSON: All right with everybody here? Amazing how we can change our minds. Victor you should celebrate a bit.

STOCK: Hey, this is Ann Stock.

## Transcript of September 15, 2011 Meeting

ISAACSON: Hey Ann. Third person, Ann Stock. This is an open meeting and we've decided not to close this meeting. So it's being recorded, so if you have negative things to say about anybody hold your piece while the recording is on.

STOCK: I'll be good.

ISAACSON: All right. I want to start by thanking Maryjean, Dick, Jeff, the Strategy and Budget Committee or whatever. There were large amounts of disagreements about how far we follow strategy versus how we make cuts. Now, they're very small amounts of disagreements and pretty much all those have been resolved, and we have had a vote of the Budget Committee.

[REDACTED]

I want to allow both Michael and others who have some strategic thoughts that they want to give, and then I would like to call for a vote on the recommendation of the Budget and Strategy Committee that the budget be approved.

So, let me open it up for discussions since we are not going to have a full fledged briefing of it now as we've all been briefed. Plus, in the open meeting we don't want to be briefed.

Paul?

KOLLMER-DORSEY: Mr. Chairman, just to clarify the actual vote on the budget itself, you would have to do that in the closed session unless you would like that to become public, and that would be in contravention to OMB guidance. The strategy leading up to that can be discussed.

ISAACSON: I'm going to say that we are going to vote on the budget in public, and we are going to contravene OMB, is that all right?

KOLLMER-DORSEY: It would be inconsistent with the OMB guidance that we got.

ISAACSON: Right. Does that mean we'd have to put out the entire OMB budget in the minutes today if we vote on it?

KOLLMER-DORSEY: Yes, that's exactly what it means. So, my recommendation, Mr. Chairman, is that if you want to discuss strategy and the strategic narrative surrounding the budget, that would be fine.

ISAACSON: Would it be ok to vote on this budget and also to vote to not put in the minutes the numbers of the budget until the President submitted it according to OMB guidance?

KOLLMER-DORSEY: I think that can be done.

## Transcript of September 15, 2011 Meeting

ISAACSON: Would everybody agree to that? That we do the vote and do it publicly, and that we don't put in the minutes the details of the numbers until OMB has submitted it. Is that ok with you, Victor? Ok?

ASHE: We have conflicting guidance, which should come as no surprise, from OMB because on January 21, 2009, one of the President's first initiatives was to reemphasize his commitment to transparency and it's a very strong memo that Michael has read and I and some others that Paul was kind enough to send all of us, which is very strong. Obviously, the other memo that comes out in preparing and dealing with this budget would tend to go for this issue only a different direction, and that presents, I would say, almost a conflict to some degree or at least a disparity and as a result, those of us would just have to look at it in a way we think we best are.

I think the position you fashioned, Mr. Chairman, is a wise one where we simply withhold the actual document until such time as the President, and who knows what OMB will do with our recommendations anyway, they can totally junk it. But on the other hand, the general discussions would be open. And I think what the President has said through his OMB Director Mr. Orszag, I believe the former director now, the day after he took office was a strong support for transparency. There is no question about that.

ISAACSON: I think that we, as an Agency and as a Board, have been more open and more transparent, have webcast, have opened things up, and we want to continue in that process so we don't get any feedback.

The proposal on the table, and I'll make it an open vote, which is that we discuss this openly, we vote on this openly, but in the minutes until the submission has been done by OMB, we leave out the President's numbers in accordance with OMB guidance. But that as soon as that's possible that too is added to the minutes.

I hear a second from Victor, who has already seconded that. All in favor of that approach please say aye.

ALL: Aye.

ISAACSON: Any opposed? All right, therefore it is done. And it's being recorded, and everybody is minuting it, etc.

Michael, should I turn to you, because know you had some strategic things or do wanted to do in a later meeting, or I'll let you do it whenever you want.

MEEHAN: Well, thank you Mr. Chairman. It's been a pleasure to serve on the Budget & Strategy Committee for the last 14 months. As I mentioned this to you before, I would like this to be my last day on the Budget and Strategy Committee. So, in the year plus that we've been reviewing the strategy we went through 100 countries, 59 languages, every region, brought many of the networks together to the table and had a lot of things happened just by the simple fact that

## Transcript of September 15, 2011 Meeting

people convened and came together to figure out how to do things better. So I was heartened to see some of the activities there.

A couple of things that came out of there that were important to us is when we talked about Africa, it was suggested by the staff that if Governors went to Africa we can expand our reach and get some more licenses. I was glad to go with Governor Perino and Governor McCue this past June, which we did accomplish that. We signed three or four more agreements with affiliates in Nigeria. While we were there, had a great visit with the people in South Sudan who were excited to have our help who also agreed to put up a VOA tower and give us a license there. So, we are very heartened that some of that stuff was easy, not expensive to do in ways to expand our reach and audience.

The Board did vote in June to follow a strategy that would focus on the tougher countries in the world that have closed press. It was my hope that this Board continues to follow down that path in terms of where we spend our funds and also think outside the box in ways that we can do an even better job as we transition from some, we are a technology, platform communications agnostic Board, but to make sure that we do that in a way that maximizes the dollars that we have. And for me, I'd just prefer to be consistent unless I have a reason, unless there's compelling amount of evidence not to maintain a position that we previously had.

So generally speaking, I support 95% of what the Budget and Strategy Committee is recommending for the Board to do.

I do have concerns about China. I think China is a hugely important target for us as a Board. I think that VOA and Radio Free Asia both have presences there. [REDACTED]

But in the meantime, I'd also been heartened by Director Ensor and President Liu's discussions in hearings and subsequently that, they will come to us with a plan that we will take to OMB and to the Congress to expand China satellite and to come up with a plan that will actually help us move forward on the satellite part of this.

I think that it does need a multi-tier approach. As you all know, we've suffered through this that as shortwave is dwindling, I think we need to move quickly into technologies that move forward, but there are a handful of places around the world where shortwave is still vitally important, and we need to be cost efficient about that. It's a big expenditure, and I think that each network is moving in that direction. I think the Board should continue to support efforts to move more quickly in that direction. So that was the one item that I wanted to raise on the record.

ISAACSON: You know that's a very good point.

Let me just add, if I may for the public record, Radio Free Asia Board meeting at the ungodly hour of eight a.m. this morning, and Director Ensor, David Ensor, of Voice of America was invited by President Libby Liu of RFA so they can jointly make a presentation on China and suggest to us that they'd be tasked to work together for a new strategy that's a proactive strategy

## Transcript of September 15, 2011 Meeting

involving China that we can go to the Hill with and others. So, I'm heartened by that as well, and I think your comments are very well taken.

Any further comments by Governors about issues?

Governor Ashe.

ASHE: Mr. Chairman, I will most reluctantly vote for this. And let me just say for the record, I don't agree with what I'm voting for in large part. I'm not particularly happy because I'm not happy with the recommendations.

ISAACSON: Meaning the [REDACTED] percentage that had to be cut?

ASHE: Well exactly, and with some of the decisions, but there is room for disagreement. Basically, we were put through an exercise by OMB that I think is unfortunate and forces us to make decisions that are contrary to the mission of this organization.

Speaking only personally, Michael, Dennis and Enders of course serving on the Strategy and Budget Committee, have a lot more information just because of the hearings and meetings they have gone through in depth. For myself, my knowledge of this, which is another reason for my reluctance, is cursory at best. I received the budget less than 40 hours ago. I did have a meeting for 40 minutes with Dick Lobo and Maryjean yesterday.

On the [REDACTED] million budget that hardly provides, I mean it was an overview, I'll put it that way. And not to be critical of them, it's simply to say at least for this one Board member, for me to suggest or to be able to go outside of this room and defend or explain how I voted in any detail, I would have to say I don't know because I don't. So, I'm just putting this on the record because that's how I feel. I had a good chat with the Chairman yesterday and as usual, he is persuasive and is getting me to vote for something I really don't agree with, but I'll do it in recognition of his leadership and what he says.

I do think in the future, for those Governors who want or are interested, which I assume all are, but do not serve on the committees where this would normally come through, that you have to have a, and I realize the staff is just frankly overwhelmed between this and consolidation and everything else, you hardly have time to come up for air. But, less than two days notice to at least one Board member just doesn't cut it.

Our By-Laws provide, and they generally haven't been able to be met, says where practicable, information will be sent to the Board fourteen (14) days in advance of the meeting. This wasn't even two of the 14. So I just have a problem with that, and the same is true when we go into the regular public meeting this afternoon. I think what we have to do, either change the By-Laws to say 14 days is unrealistic and it should only be seven (7) or whatever, but let's not just totally ignore what the By-Laws say because we can't honor it.

## Transcript of September 15, 2011 Meeting

ISAACSON: I will say that 14 days ago I mean you were on vacation, as you know, in Scotland. I was given quite a bit of this and many of us were. I think you make a very good point.

We did have a somewhat extraordinary year this year where we went through a sudden OMB changes in guidance. I hope that next year since strategy has already been set by the Strategy and Budget Committee that the budget will be much more. We have new entity heads, (i.e., David Ensor is in, Steven Korn is in at RFE). The budget will be done on a step-by-step basis by the entity heads and the management staff and every month, we will be briefed on progress towards the budget.

So not only it will be 14 days, but it will be 14 weeks as we see this step-by-step.

Let me just to be a small counterpart, let me thank, I think Enders and Dennis and Michael have spent an extraordinary amount and time, and Maryjean who really you know, day after day I was getting reports, and I know how much pressure was put on you. I don't want people to come away with the impression that this was slap-dash at the last moment. This was approximately eleven months of hearings and work, and the past four or five weeks you have done a particularly good job and I want to thank you very much.

Other governors who want to speak?

If not, I have a motion proposed by the Strategy and Budget Committee that the budget proposal be approved.

ASHE: Mr. Chairman, someone has to make a motion.

ISAACSON: You want what, a motion? Right. Do I have a motion for that? Dennis?

MULHAUPT: So moved.

ISAACSON: Do I have a seconded? Anybody?

MCCUE: I'll second it for this.

ISAACSON: Yep, yep. Two seconded so far. All in favor please say aye.

ALL: Aye.

ISAACSON: Any opposed please say nay.

The budget is carried. Is there anything else? We're going to have a further meeting this afternoon starting at 2, is that correct? Lunch, etc.

LOBO: A further Governors' Briefing after the break.

## Transcript of September 15, 2011 Meeting

ASHE: I move we stand in recess.

ISAACSON: I hear a motion that we stand in recess until two o'clock. And thanks. I know how hard it was for everyone to get around here and do things on a complex time table. Thank you all for those who are on the phone, for those who voted.

I'm glad we do have a vote here after a very long process. Is there a seconded to the motion that we stand in recess? Seconded it, Dennis, is that right? Is that the proper way?

MULHAUPT: Sure.

ISAACSON: All in favor please say aye.

ALL: Aye.

ISAACSON: Any opposed please say nay. Ok, we're in recess.

# Transcript of September 15, 2011 Meeting

Federal Register / Vol. 76, No. 175 / Friday, September 9, 2011 / Notices

55871

In the *Federal Register* of July 28, 2011, in FR Doc. 2011-19135, on page 45225, in the first column, correct the "6. Literacy (20 percent) including:" caption to read:

6. Framework Alignment (20 percent) including:

In the *Federal Register* of July 28, 2011, in FR Doc. 2011-19135, on page 45225, in the first column, correct the "9. The following factors will reduce FAS's evaluation of the application because they negatively reflect on an organization's ability to successfully implement and complete a grant agreement with USDA:" section to read:

9. The following factors may negatively reflect on an applicant's ability to successfully implement and complete a grant agreement with FAS. When one or more of these factors applies to an applicant, FAS will consider such factor(s) and may deduct points when evaluating the applicant's proposal against certain of the criteria outlined above. The presence of one or more of these factors will not automatically preclude the applicant from receiving a grant.

(a) FAS has terminated an agreement with the organization within the past 3 years as a result of a violation of the agreement by the organization.

(b) The organization has failed to pay a single substantial debt, or a number of outstanding debts (not including sums owed the Federal Government under the Internal Revenue Code) owed to any Federal agency or instrumentality, provided the debt is uncontested by the organization or, if contested, provided that the organization's legal and administrative remedies have been exhausted.

(c) The organization has failed to submit to FAS, or has submitted more than 5 business days after the due date, at least two required reports within the past 3 years (unless, prior to the due date for a report, the organization obtained written permission from FAS to submit the report after such date).

(d) The organization has, on at least two occasions within the past 3 years, failed to respond, or responded more than 5 business days late, to an FAS deadline for documents required to close out an agreement.

Dated: August 30, 2011.

**Bruce Quick,**

*Acting Administrator, Foreign Agricultural Service.*

[FR Doc. 2011-23052 Filed 9-8-11; 8:45 am]

BILLING CODE 3410-10-P

## BROADCASTING BOARD OF GOVERNORS

### Sunshine Act Meeting

**DATE AND TIME:** Thursday, September 15, 2011, 9:45 a.m.

**PLACE:** Broadcasting Board of Governors, Cohen Building, Room 3321, 330 Independence Ave., SW., Washington, DC 20237.

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Closed Meeting of the Broadcasting Board of Governors.

**SUMMARY:** At the time and location listed above, the Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) will conduct a meeting closed to the public pursuant to 5 U.S.C. 552b(c)(9)(B) because, according to Office of Management and Budget Circular A-11, Section 36, public knowledge of a draft Presidential budget could lead to frustration of a proposed agency action. The BBG will receive and consider staff recommendations regarding the Fiscal Year 2013 budget.

**MEMBERS VOTE TO CLOSE THE MEETING:**

Walter Isaacson—Yes

Victor Ashe—No

Susan McCue—Yes

Michael Lynton—Yes

Michael Meehan—Yes

Dennis Mulhaupt—Yes

Dana Perino—Did not vote

S. Enders Wimbush—Yes

Ann Stock, Acting Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy and Public Affairs—Yes

**TO BE IN ATTENDANCE:**

Walter Isaacson, BBG Chairman

Victor Ashe, BBG Member

Susan McCue, BBG Member (via telephone)

Michael Meehan, BBG Member

Dennis Mulhaupt, BBG Member

Dana Perino, BBG Member

Richard Lobo, Director of the

International Broadcasting Bureau

Jeffrey Trimble, BBG Executive Director

Maryjean Buhler, BBG Chief Financial

Officer

Paul Kollmer-Dorsey, BBG Deputy

General Counsel and Board Secretary

Lynne Weil, Senior Advisor to the

Under Secretary for Public Diplomacy

and Public Affairs

Oanh Tran, BBG Special Projects Officer

**FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT:**

Persons interested in obtaining more

information should contact Paul

Kollmer-Dorsey at (202) 203-4545.

**Paul Kollmer-Dorsey,**

*Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary.*

[FR Doc. 2011-23212 Filed 9-7-11; 4:15 pm]

BILLING CODE 8610-01-P

## BROADCASTING BOARD OF GOVERNORS

### Sunshine Act Meeting

**DATE AND TIME:** Thursday, September 15, 2011, 2 p.m.

**PLACE:** Broadcasting Board of Governors, VOA Briefing Room (Room 1528-A), 330 Independence Ave., SW., Washington, DC 20237.

**SUBJECT:** Notice of Meeting of the Broadcasting Board of Governors.

**SUMMARY:** The Broadcasting Board of Governors (BBG) will be meeting at the time and location listed above. The BBG will receive and consider recommendations regarding a proposed new strategic plan and the revision of Agency grant agreements. The BBG will receive reports from: The BBG's Strategy and Budget Committee and Governance Committee; the International Broadcasting Bureau Director; and the Voice of America, the Office of Cuba Broadcasting, Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty, Radio Free Asia, and the Middle East Broadcasting Networks regarding programming coverage updates. The BBG will also receive an update on digital innovations. The meeting is open to public observation via streamed Webcast, both live and on-demand, on the BBG's public Web site at <http://www.bbg.gov>.

**CONTACT PERSON FOR MORE INFORMATION:**

Persons interested in obtaining more

information should contact Paul

Kollmer-Dorsey at (202) 203-4545.

**Paul Kollmer-Dorsey,**

*Deputy General Counsel and Board Secretary.*

[FR Doc. 2011-23222 Filed 9-7-11; 4:15 pm]

BILLING CODE 8610-01-P

## COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS

### Agenda and Notice of Public Meeting of the Louisiana Advisory Committee

Notice is hereby given, pursuant to the provisions of the rules and regulations of the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights (Commission), and the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), that a planning meeting of the Louisiana Advisory Committee to the Commission will convene by conference call at 1 p.m. and adjourn at approximately 3 p.m. on Friday, September 30, 2011. The purpose of this meeting is to continue planning the Committee's civil rights project. Review and discuss information collected at the SAC's public briefing meeting on May 10, 2011.

This meeting is available to the public through the following toll-free call-in

